

MAKE YOUR CASE!

NAME: _____ DATE: _____

DIRECTIONS

For each of the scenarios below, explain how each piece of evidence corroborates the initial account. Then choose the piece of evidence that would make a stronger case and explain your selection.

SCENARIO A

On the night before the big game between your school's team, the Panthers, and your biggest rivals, the Bears, the Bears' locker room was vandalized. Many of the players from the Bears are accusing members of your team of committing the vandalism. The Panthers say that they couldn't have vandalized the locker room because they were all out for pizza when the locker room was raided. Additional testimony:

Account A:

Statement by the Panther quarterback's older sister saying that she drove them to the pizza place on the night the locker room was vandalized.

Account B:

Statement from the Bears' running back saying that he saw the Panthers at the pizza place the night the locker room was vandalized.

QUESTIONS

(1) How do both Account A and Account B corroborate the Panthers' account?

(2) Which of the two pieces of testimony would make their case stronger? _____ Explain.

CONTINUE 

SCENARIO B

You are a principal who is trying to figure out the truth about a lunchroom fight. The fight was between Justin and Max. Justin is a new student. He is shy and doesn't have many friends. Max is a popular student who is known for his friendliness.

Account A: Justin

"Max started it. I was just standing in line waiting to pay for my food, and he shoved me super hard. And for no reason! He just freaked out on me. I don't even know the kid, and he's been weird to me ever since I started going to this school. Him and his friends glare at me in English class for no reason."

Account B: Max

"That kid is psycho. He turned around and punched me out of nowhere. Me and my friends were standing in line just joking around, and he turned around and punched me for no reason. He's messed up and creepy. Ask anyone."

Account C: Jamie (student who has class with Max and Justin right before lunch)

"I wasn't in the cafeteria today, and I'm not friends with any of those guys, but I've seen Max and his friends be mean to Justin in the hallways and in class when the teacher isn't looking. Not physical or anything, but they'll like say jokes under their breath and then laugh and stuff like that. They make him uncomfortable."

(3) What does each account say about who started the fight?

(a) Account A: _____

(b) Account B: _____

(c) Account C: _____

(4) Based on these three accounts, can you determine who started the fight? (Circle One.)

(a) Yes

(b) No

(5) Explain your answer to question #4 (above):

CONTINUE 

(6) What does each account say about how Max and his friends treat Justin?

(a) Account A: _____

(b) Account B: _____

(c) Account C: _____

(7) Based on these three accounts, can you determine how Max and his friends treat Justin?

(a) Yes

(b) No

(8) Explain your answer to question #7 (above):

(9) Why does Jamie's account (Account C) help you build a stronger case than if you just had Max's and Justin's accounts?
